

# State of Illinois PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

Wm. G. Stratton Office Bldg. 401 South Spring St., Rm. 402 Springfield, Illinois 62706 (T) 217.782.6076 (F) 217.785.4425 (TTY) 217.785.4427

MAURO GLORIOSO

Executive Director & General Counsel

Minutes of the

Suburban North Regional Office 9511 W. Harrison St., Suite LL-54 Des Plaines, Illinois 60016 (T) 847.294.4121 (F) 847.294.4799

# Property Tax Appeal Board December 17, 2019 – 10:00 a.m. Springfield & Des Plaines, Illinois

1. Roll Call: Jim Bilotta; Kevin L. Freeman, Dana D. Kinion; and Robert J. Steffen;

**Staff:** Mauro Glorioso, Executive Director and General Counsel;

Steve Waggoner, Chief Administrative Law Judge;

David Suarez, Chief Information Officer;

James J. Moffat, Chief Fiscal Officer & Human Resources;

Michael Bullock, Administrative Law Judge, Public Service

Administrator;

Dianne Lerman, Recording Secretary.

**Guest**: Cristin Duffy, Assistant State's Attorney

Carrie Brown, CSR, Court Report, Lexitas Legal

Mr. Freeman, Acting Chairman, convened the meeting at 10:00 a.m.

#### 2. Approval of Minutes from Previous Meeting

Mr. Steffen moved to approve the Board Minutes of November 11, 2019 as presented. Mrs. Kinion seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

#### 3. Adoption or Amendments to the Agenda

Mr. Freeman moved to amend the Agenda allowing State's Attorney, Cristin Duffy to attend the meeting to discuss the Cook County Board of Review's Motion to Default

#### **BOARD MEMBERS**

Kevin L. Freeman Jim Bilotta Robert J. Steffen Dana D. Kinion

Chicago Frankfort South Barrington Springfield

Judgement carried over from the November 12, 2019 Board Meeting. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

Ms. Duffy brought a Court Reporter, Ms. Carrie Brown, from Lexitas Legal to record the Motion to Reconsider Defaulted Judgement.

A lengthy discussion followed regarding a technical problem where PTAB did not receive entries for 1,596 Cook County cases. PTAB received index files for the dates in question but they did not have entries for 1,596 cases. This resulted in the default of the 1,596 cases.

Mr. Freeman moved to direct PTAB staff to work with the Board of Review to set up conferences with respective Attorneys representing these cases to propose possible settlement agreements but Staying the Motion to Default. Mr. Bilotta seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

### 4. Executive Director's Report

Mr. Glorioso turned the meeting over to David Suarez for an update on current IT activities.

Mr. Suarez reported a new person was hired for the IT position and is scheduled to start in January.

Mr. Suarez presented a PTAB Information Technology power point presentation viewed on screen with charts: Chart #1 reflected the breakdown of new appeals added during year, appeals closed during year, and appeals pending at end of year; Chart #2 reflected a breakdown in the number of appeals by Cook County verses downstate counties; Charts #3 through 6 reflected the proposed Timeline beginning with the current year through 2024 for planned and anticipated goals and objectives of the PTAB IT Department for completion of the on-line filing project. The Board discussed the slides, the backlog of cases and the possibility of filing fees. Mr. Freeman requested staff to research information available regarding other states that have adopted filing fees. The Board thanked Mr. Suarez for his presentation and requested copies of the presentation for review and discussion at the January Board Meeting.

Mr. Glorioso and the Board thanked Mr. Suarez for his report.

Mr. Glorioso turned the meeting over to James J. Moffat. Mr. Moffat reported on staffing. He reported an IT Specialist was hired and will be starting on January 6<sup>th</sup>. He further reported on 75-day workers returning to PTAB in January.

Mr. Moffat reported he filed the Agency Workforce Report to Social Security and a copy was sent to the Governor's Office.

Mr. Moffat reported on the issuance of merit comp stipend and pay raises to merit comp staff consistent with the State's union workers. He stated the raise is set at 1.5% and 2.1% on July 1<sup>st</sup>.

Mr. Moffat reported PTAB received a class action grievance concerning telecommuting. He stated the current policy on working from home

Mr. Glorioso and the Board thanked Mr. Moffat for his report.

Mr. Glorioso reported on staffing, Mick Cody resumed the remaining term of his 75-day temporary assignment on December 1<sup>st</sup> at Springfield as a hearing officer. We have another 75-day worker starting January 13, 2020 in the Springfield Office, Rick Kenner. Additionally, Gerry Mahr, Jo Ellen Mahr, and Mick Cody will be starting in Springfield the beginning of January 2020. He further reported Greg Costa will return to the Des Plaines Office to resume another 75-day assignment as a hearing officer beginning in January. All these 75-day workers have previously been with PTAB, so this should aid in closing files. Mr. Glorioso reported Beth Leet is becoming more proficient in her new position as assistant to JJ and we hope to be able to keep her at that position. Our front desk temporary person in Des Plaines was asked to leave and we are looking for a replacement. He further reported he would like to put a full-time person there who can also help with scanning. Mr. Glorioso reported Dave Suarez and Dave Egan have offered a position for a new hire for the IT department. This additional person will help with the IT work load. Mr. Glorioso further reported posting for two new positions in Springfield, an Appraisal Specialist I and an Appraisal Specialist Trainee.

Mr. Glorioso reported the CCBOR Motion to Reconsider Defaults of some 1,596 cases for lack of evidence filing with the PTAB was presented last month by Cristin Duffy. CCBOR requests that PTAB rescind its default in all cases. The response from David Suarez was handed out last month and the CCBOR wishes to respond to it.

Mr. Glorioso reported as previously mentioned Dave Suarez has procured and will set up Microsoft tablets (7) for use by the ALJs at their PHCs and other hearings. Mr. Suarez reports he completed two of the seven tablets and the IT department is working on a new appeal lookup program that is compatible with the tablets. He further reported currently the tablets require a person to log on to the network using a wired connection before you

can use them thru WI-FI. PTAB has only two network dongles so the IT staff has done the initial configuration on two of the tablets.

Mr. Glorioso reported attending a meeting with Ann Spillane General Counsel for the Governor and the other GC's from across the state at the JRTC. Several areas were covered, and a power point presentation was distributed. He further reported we went over a number of issues and the person or persons to contact in the event of a problem. Those included issues on Ethics, OEIG Referrals, Agency Personal Problems, Reporting Sexual Harassment, Shakman Compliance, FOIA requests, Administrative Rules.

Mr. Glorioso reported he and Steve Waggoner appeared before the Governor's Task Force on Property Tax Relief at the JRTC. He stated, we appeared in front of the Subcommittee on Assessments and Exemptions and they inquired what the PTAB does and if we offer solutions to provide taxpayer relief in the form of reduced assessments which would result in tax refunds especially to homeowners in hardest hit areas. Mr. Glorioso further reported the members had also heard from others, including the CCBOR of our ongoing/ever increasing backlog. In response, he proposed the need for twice the number of Hearing Officers. Mr. Glorioso further reported he provided answers to the Committee's additional questions regarding the PTAB Board, the number of appeals they review and approve each month. He further reported he provided a bar graph to the Committee. The Committee inquired why the board only meets once a month and stated the board should be more engaged with the agency, meet more often and assist in the reduction of the backlog by hearing and writing decisions. The Committee stated they will be making recommendations to the governor's staff for entry into their final report.

Mr. Glorioso distributed copies of the Synopsis of Representative Cases for 2018. Mr. Glorioso gave special thanks to Jennifer Johnson, Carol Kirbach, and Steve Waggoner for their efforts in the assembling and production of this publication. He further reported the synopsis is free, copies are available at the Springfield or Des Plaines Office and is also posted on our website for downloading and printing.

Mr. Glorioso reported the Regulatory Agenda, in accordance with 86 Ill. Admin. Code 1910 has been prepared and filed with the Department of Index.

Mr. Glorioso reported PTAB completed the 2019 Mandatory Sexual Harassment Prevention Training. This is required each year in accordance with The State Officials and Employees Ethics Act.

Mr. Glorioso reported Performance Evaluations have been diligently attended to by each employee's supervisor and we hope to have this task completed by the end of the month. He further stated this should eliminate one of the three issues cited by the Auditor General. Mr. Glorioso reported today's meeting covers the first five months of the new fiscal year. We have closed a total of 1,575 decisions for this month. Our backlog of pending cases is currently at 67,546

Mr. Glorioso reported next month's meeting will take place on Tuesday, January 14, 2020 in the PTAB offices in Springfield and Des Plaines. Mr. Glorioso wished all a very Merry Christmas and Happy Holidays. The Board thanked Mr. Glorioso for his report.

Mr. Freeman moved to approve the Executive Director's Report. Mrs. Kinion seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

#### 5. Discussion of Motions

a. BHCP Bourbonnais LLC: #18-01044-C-3 (Kankakee)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant the Kankakee County Board of Review a final 60-day extension. Mrs. Kinion seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

b. Daniel G Kamin Ottawa LLC: #18-04617-C-2 (LaSalle) Kroger Limited Partnership: #18-04618-C-3 (LaSalle)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant the LaSalle County Board of Review a final 60-day extension in each appeal. Mr. Kinion seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

c. Tollgate Business Center Condominiums: #18-04014-I-1 (Kane)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant the Kane County Board of Review a final 60-day extension. Mrs. Kinion seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

d. Prasong Amarathithada: #17-06521-R-1 (Kane)

Jose A. Alvarez: #17-06522-R-1 (Kane) Michael Torpy: #17-06523-R-1 (Kane) Robert J. Anthes: #17-06524-R-1 (Kane) John Fugate: #17-06525-R-1 (Kane) Natalie Jump: #17-06527-R-1 (Kane) Austin Holdings: #17-06528-R-1 (Kane) Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 30-day extension to the Kane County Board of Review in each appeal. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

e. Chicago Title Land Trust Company: #18-01351-C-3 (Madison)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor Southwestern Illinois College. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

f. Locust Hills Village, LLC: #18-03971-C-3 (St. Clair) Lake Christine Apartments, LLC: #18-03969-C-2 (St. Clair) Century Development, LLC: #18-03970-C-3 (St. Clair)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 60-day extension in each appeal to Southwestern Illinois College. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

g. Nancy Baker, Trustee: #18-02808-C-2 (Lake)
David Martin: #18-02849-R-2 (Lake)
Andy Wang: #18-03094-C-3 (Lake)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 60-day extension in each appeal to Intervenors Barrington C.U.S.D. #220 and Board of Education of Rondout #72. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

h. Rosenthal - Boris Bldg Partnership: #17-03149-C-1 (Lake)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor Hawthorne S.D. #73. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

i. JPMCC 2006-LDP9 Wirsing Parkway, LLC: #17-05484-I-3 (DeKalb) Macy's: #18-01376-C-3 (Lake) 905 N Llc: #18-02712-C-3 (Lake)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenors Hawthorn S.D. #73, Sycamore S.D. #427 and Libertyville S.D. #70 in each appeal. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

j. BHCP Bourbonnais LLC: #18-01044-C-3 (Kankakee)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor Bourbonnais S.D. #53. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

k. Dunham Property Holdings, LLC: #18-03925-C-2 (McHenry)

Gateway Industrial Properties: #18-04110-I-3 (DuPage)

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day extension in each appeal to Intervenors Harvard S.D. #50 (18-03925); Addison S.D. #4, Addison Public Library, Addison Fire Protection, Village of Addison and DuPage H.S.D. #88 (18-04110). Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

- 1. Community Consolidated School Dist. #93: #17-05792-I-3 (DuPage)
  Community Consolidated School Dist. #93: #17-06280-I-3 (DuPage)
  Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day extension in each appeal to Intervenors
  Prologis and Acmate Management, Inc., owners/taxpayer. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.
- m. Community Consolidated S.D. #93: #17-05785-I-3 (DuPage)

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day extension to Intervenor Prologis, owner/taxpayer. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

n. Minooka Community High School Dist 111: #18-02706-I-3 (Will)

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day extension to Intervenor LIT Industrial, LP, owner/taxpayer. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

o. Community Consolidated School Dist. #93: #17-05780-I-3 (DuPage)
Community Consol School Dist No 93: #17-05779-I-3 (DuPage)
Community Consolidated School Dist. #93: #17-05782-I-3 (DuPage)

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day extension in each appeal. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

p. View St. Charles: #18-01025-C-3 (Kane)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor St. Charles C.U.S.D. #303. Mr. Bilotta seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

q. Medline Industries Inc: #18-01154-I-3 (Lake)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor C.H.S.D. #128. Mr. Bilotta seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

r. Kroger Stores Co: #18-01792-C-3 (Tazewell)

Mr. Bilotta moved to grant a final 90-day extension to Intervenor Morton C.U.S.D. #709. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

s. Larry Hero: #15-40488-C-2 (Cook - Bremen)
Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor Cook County
S.D. #130 requested to intervene on June 20, 2019 and was granted a 90-day
extension. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

t. Rush Oak Park Hospital: #18-22844-C-3 (Cook - Oak Park)

Mr. Freeman moved to grant a final 30-day extension to Intervenor Oak Park River Forest H.S.D. #200. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

u. DiMucci Companies: #18-21724-R-2 (Cook - Elk Grove)

Mr. Steffen moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor C.C.S.D. #72. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

v. Rush Oak Park Hospital: #18-22844-C-3 (Cook - Oak Park)

Mr. Steffen moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor Oak Park S.D. #97. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

w. FedEx Ground Package System, Inc.: #18-24456-I-3 (Cook - Stickney)

Mr. Steffen moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenor Reavis H.S.D. #220. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

x. Great Northern Lumber Co.: #18-24559-I-2 (Cook - Calumet)

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day extension to Intervenors H.S.D. #218 and City of Blue Island. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

y. Great Northern Lumber Co.: #18-24559-I-2 (Cook - Calumet)

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day extension to Intervenor Cook County S.D. #130. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

z. Lansing Shopping Delaware Trust: #17-41025-C-2 (Cook - Thornton)

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day extension to Intervenor Village of Lansing. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

aa. Theodore Mavrakis: #18-26089-C-2 (Cook - Northfield)

Mr. Bilotta moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenors Glenbrook H.S.D. #225 and West Northfield S.D. #31. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

bb. Horatio Enacopol: #18-25962-C-2 (Cook - Lemont)

Poplar Creek Crossing, LLC: #18-25422-C-3 (Cook - Barrington)

US Bank #4414: #18-25415-C-2 (Cook - Lemont)

Target Corporation: #18-25315-C-3 (Cook - Barrington)

Target Corporation: #18-25035-C-3 (Cook - Lemont)

Mr. Bilotta moved to grant a final 60-day extension to Intervenors Lemont H.S.D. #210 and C.U.S.D. #300 in each appeal. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

cc. Walgreens: #18-04107-C-2 (DuPage)

Elmhurst Auto Group/Elmhurst Toyota: #18-04109-C-3 (DuPage)

Dimitri Bousis: #18-24908-C-3 (Cook – Rogers Park)

The Palmolive Building Landmark: #17-44541-R-2 (Cook – North Chicago)

Parth Shaha: #18-22262-C-2 (Cook – Elk Grove)

Mr. Bilotta moved to grant a final 60-day extension to each of the Intervenors, Indian Prairie C.U.S.D. #204, Elmhurst C.U.S.D. #205, Chicago Board of Education and Elk Grove Community School Dist. No. 59. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

dd. Community Consolidated School District #93: #17-05773-C-2

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant a final 90-day final extension to Intervenor Bloomingdale Court, LLC. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

ee. Tina Coyle-Evans: #18-05259-R-1 (Madison)

Mrs. Kinion moved to deny the Motion to Reinstate due to lack of jurisdiction. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

ff. Barbara Leiter: #18-03335-R-1 (Peoria)

Mr. Steffen moved to deny the Motion to Reinstate. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

gg. Barbara Westell: #18-04553-R-1 (Will)

Mrs. Kinion moved to deny the Motion to Reinstate. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

hh. Lake County BOR – Additional Extension Request.

Mrs. Kinion moved to grant the Lake County Board of Review a final 60-day extension for those appeals where the extension requests were timely made and deny the extension requests where the requests were not timely made. Mr. Bilotta seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

ii. 2789 Oak (HP) LLC: #17-01503-R-3 (Lake)

Mrs. Kinion moved to deny the Lake County Board of Review's Motion to Vacate Default. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

jj. J.C. Penney Company, Inc.: #18-00877-C-3

Mrs. Kinion moved to deny the School District's Motion to Intervene. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

kk. Natasa Glamoclija: #17-33307

Mr. Steffen moved to deny the Motion to Reconsider Decision. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

Mr. Bilotta requested the Board allow him to participate in the remainder of the meeting via his telephone.

Mr. Freeman motioned to allow Mr. Bilotta to participate in the remainder of the meeting via telephone. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 3-0.

#### 6. Attachments

As to Attachment A, Mr. Freeman moved to approve the attachment. Mrs. Kinion seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

As to Attachment B, Mrs. Kinion moved to approve the attachment as amended. Mr. Bilotta seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

As to Attachment C, Mr. Steffen moved to approve the attachment. Mrs. Kinion seconded the Motion and it carried 3-0 with Mr. Freeman recusing.

As to Attachment D, Mrs. Kinion moved to approve the attachment. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 3-0 with Mr. Bilotta recusing.

As to Attachment E, Mr. Freeman moved to approve the attachment. Mr. Bilotta seconded the Motion and it carried 3-0 with Mr. Steffen recusing.

As to Attachment F, Mr. Freeman moved to approve the attachment. Mr. Bilotta seconded the Motion and it carried 3-0 with Mrs. Kinion recusing.

As to Attachment Z, Mr. Steffen moved to approve the attachment. Mr. Freeman seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

## **Workload Report**

Mr. Glorioso presented and reviewed the Workload Report FY20 data through November 30, 2019. He stated this report reflects open appeals at the beginning of the year, new appeals added during the year, appeals closed during the year and appeals pending at the end of the year. Mr. Glorioso reported staff produced 1,575 closed appeals for the month of November.

#### 7. Other Business

Mr. Freeman asked Ms. Lerman to arrange a Holiday / New Year Luncheon for PTAB staff and Board Members at both the Springfield and Des Plaines Offices in coordination with the Springfield Office staff. The luncheon will take place immediately following the January 14, 2020 Board Meeting.

The Board wished all a Merry Christmas, Happy Holidays, and a very Happy New Year.

#### 8. Adjournment

Mr. Freeman moved to adjourn the meeting at 12:25 pm. Mr. Steffen seconded the Motion and it carried 4-0.

Minutes of the Property Tax Appeal Board December 17, 2019 Page 12

Respectfully Submitted,

Mauro Glorioso

**Executive Director and General Counsel** 

MG/dl